

---

**LANDMARKS COMMISSION**

**June 19, 2007**

**Minutes**

---

Members Present: Robert Calk  
Michael McClellan  
Bill Minter  
Steve Butman  
Rick Weatherl  
Tina Cargile, Alternate

Members Absent: Phil Miller  
Pebbles Lee  
Laura Wardroup, Alternate

Staff Present: Larry Abrigg, Planner III, Historic Preservation Officer

Guests: John Upchurch, Lisa Upchurch, Christy Tomlin, James Tomlin

Mr. Weatherl called the meeting to order at 4:05 PM, declared a quorum present, and read the opening statement.

Minutes of the May 29, 2007 meeting were submitted for approval. The minutes were approved by unanimous vote. Ms. Cargile made the motion and Mr. Butman seconded the motion.

Agenda Item 3: CA-0807, Public hearing and possible vote to consider a Certificate of Appropriateness request from Alley Cats, John Upchurch, applicant, to change the signage and place a stucco material over the blue tile at the front entrance at 216 Pine Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Mr. Abrigg to give the staff report.

Mr. Abrigg highlighted the staff report and showed pictures of 216 Pine Street. Mr. McClellan asked how old the tile would have to be to be considered historic. Mr. Abrigg said the benchmark year is 50 years or 1957. Several members talked among themselves about the blue tile on the wall and the blue/white tile on the floor.

Mr. Weatherl opened the public hearing.

Mr. Upchurch discussed the relevance of stucco as a historic material. He said where the tile was broken they believe there was stucco or concrete behind the tile, but they are not certain. There may have been stucco before the 1920's remodel. The entryway tile will remain, but a rubber mat will cover the entryway floor. It would be expensive to replace the tile. They are 4x4 and an inch thick. He passed around pictures of the building in the 1930's or 1950's and additional photographs taken in approximately 1996. The blue tile went with the decoration then, but doesn't match their décor. They don't want to destroy any part of the building. The building looks better with the stucco. The sign frame will remain and they will use the existing frame. They will eventually totally repair the windows and are painting the trim white. Commissioners asked questions about the signage.

Mr. Weatherl asked what the plaques said and Mr. Weatherl said he assisted with the National Register nomination. A discussion about the development of this part of Pine ensued. Mr. Weatherl said the plaques tell us the façade is protected.

Mr. Upchurch said they weren't aware of the historic designation. Mr. Upchurch also said that who ever sells the historic buildings need to give the new owner a folder or something to tell them it is historic.

Mr. Tomlin spoke. He said they didn't know the historic value. Since 1996 it has been a rental and renters have no vested interest. They have spent a considerable amount of money just to do little things. Alley Cats want to be downtown and remain downtown. They want to benefit the community. They will get the windows back to working order. They have a vested interest in downtown. Mr. Calk asked if the realtor made them aware of the zoning. Mr. Tomlin said he doesn't remember being told. Mr. Weatherl said he didn't want to discuss who said what and said this is like any other restriction. Mr. Upchurch said they too do not want to place the blame for why they covered the tile. Mr. Weatherl agreed that no one is looking for fault. Mr. McClellan said he remembered talking about how new owners would realize they have HO Zoning. Mr. Butman said yes the Commission did talk about it, and that that information is in the tax statement. Mr. Calk agreed.

Mr. Weatherl closed the public hearing and asked for any discussion or a motion. He said the owner of Cypress Street Station wanted to take down their tile and decided to keep it and it turned out not to be as difficult to deal with as they thought. They matched the historic tile with new tile. Ms. Cargile asked about the materials on the other building's facades. The Commission reviewed the other facades and continued to discuss the relevance of tile as a historic material. Mr. Upchurch showed the members pictures from his computer. Members continued to discuss the relevance to tile. Mr. Calk said the tile was still there even though it is covered up. Mr. Minter said Alley Cats has always done a nice job with their appearance, but the 1920's has been a theme period of time for downtown.

A motion was made by Mr. Calk and seconded by Mr. McClellan to allow the stucco material, allow the signage, but if the stucco is allowed to deteriorate the tile would need to be restored and any future changes be brought to the committee. Mr. Abrigg asked about the rubber mat. Mr. Calk said it would not be permanent. Mr. Weatherl reminded the Commission that this is a National Register building as well as a locally registered building and that tile has been on the building for about 70 years. The vote failed by a 2 to 4 vote. The two in favor were Mr. Calk and Mr. McClellan.

Mr. Abrigg reminded the chair that he could make a motion. Ms. Cargile made a motion to deny the stucco and to have the stucco removed from the tile in 60 days and to restore the tiles and match them to the best of their ability. The motion carried 4 to 2. The two opposed were Mr. Calk and Mr. McClellan. A discussion about the sign and entryway mat ensued and they agreed that they were to be permitted. Mr. Weatherl reminded the Commission, the staff and the members that any changes to the exterior of zoned historic buildings need to be approved by the Landmarks Commission and it is not personal and it is what they are charged to do.

Agenda Item 4: Adjourn

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned by Mr. Weatherl at approximately 5:00 PM.

Approved: _____, Chairman
Date: _____