
LANDMARKS COMMISSION

April 28, 2009

Minutes

Members Present: Rick Weatherl
Robert Calk
Steve Butman
Peebles Lee
Bill Minter
Dr. Michael E. McClellan

Members Absent:
Phil Miller
Laura Wardroup
Tina Cargile

Staff Present: Ben Bryner, Planning Services Manager
Molinda Parker, Senior Planner, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelley Messer, Assistant City Attorney

Guests: Emerald Lemmons

Mr. Weatherl called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM, declared a quorum present, and read the opening statement.

Minutes of the November 18, 2008 meeting were submitted for approval. Mr. Minter made the first motion to approve the minutes and Mr. Butman seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous.

Agenda Item 3: CA-2009-01, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Eric & Emerald Lemmons to replace, repair and repaint the exterior siding and wood trim on the Motz House located at 1842 N. 5th Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report and presented photos of the property showing the stages of the repair and painting.

Mr. Weatherl opened the discussion to the public and asked the applicant, Ms. Lemmons, to address the commission. Ms. Lemmons introduced herself as owner of the property at 1842 N. 5th Street and explained that all repair and painting done on the house was with the intention of restoring it to its former state, assuring the commissioners that the repainting was done with the original colors, white with green trim. Mr. Weatherl opened the hearing for discussion among the commissioners. Ms. Lee commented that she had worked with Mr. & Mrs. Coleman, former owners, who had submitted applications for Certificates of Appropriateness to the Landmarks Commission in the past. The Coleman's had done a lot of restoration on the house, but mainly on the interior. Continuing work on the house, particularly the exterior, accomplishes the goal of total restoration.

Mr. Weatherl closed the discussion. Ms. Lee made a motion to approve the request and Mr. Butman seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous. (5-0)

Agenda Item 4: CA-2009-02, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Eric & Emerald Lemmons to replace the existing roof, repair the structural elements, and replace the exterior siding and wood trim on the accessory structure in the backyard of the Motz House located at 1842 N. 5th Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report and presented photos of the accessory building in its existing condition and explained that the proposed renovations are intended to restore the building to a functioning state that closely resembles its original appearance.

Mr. Weatherl opened the Public Hearing. Ms. Lemmons confirmed her address as 1842 N. 5th Street. She explained that the horizontal boards, similar to the original, are difficult to find and are expensive due to the required special planing. Mr. Weatherl suggested that siding is an issue and that horizontal ship-lap siding could work. Ms. Lee informed Ms. Lemmons that City Lumber carries these kinds of boards for the siding and they cannot be found at Lowe's. The commissioners discussed various options, including removing salvageable horizontal siding from the north and east (alley) sides of the building. Vertical siding could be placed on the north and east sides and the salvaged horizontal boards could be used on the west and south (front/porch) sides. This would keep the horizontal look that will match the house. Mr. Weatherl and Ms. Lee shared knowledge of different siding materials, such as clap board and ship lap discussing how they fit together, acknowledging that a bead of caulk would be necessary with these alternatives. Mr. Caulk asked Ms. Lemmons if building permits have been applied for. Ms. Lemmons responded that Construction Concepts will be applying for those permits, as they will be doing the work. Ms. Lemmons remarked that the building is hazardous to her dogs and guests as its foundation has deteriorated to the point that all wood elements will have to be replaced. Ms. Lee commented that the shed section was added to the building by the former owners who painted the exterior of the building, but did no structural work on it. Mr. Caulk asked Ms. Lemmons if the building will be used as a rental. Ms. Lemmons remarked that her sister-in-law will be living in the renovated building and helping with the baby who is due to arrive in September. She added that the property is zoned multi-family and the building has been used as a rental unit in the past by previous owners.

Mr. Weatherl closed the public hearing and opened a discussion among the commissioners. Ms. Lee suggested the possibility of creating a sub-committee to look at the building and talk to Ms. Lemmon's father about the project before making a determination. Mr. Weatherl commented that salvaging old lumber is not necessarily feasible or advisable considering that the main concern is the visibility factor and the visual compatibility of the main structure with the accessory building. Mr. Caulk commented that the principal concern is that the siding on the accessory building match the house, therefore, any type of horizontal siding would be acceptable. Mr. Butman concurred. Ms. Lee agreed and added that keeping the horizontal siding on the porch side, that faces the house, would be essential. Mr. Caulk made a motion that the remodeling of the accessory structure be done in a manner to ensure compatibility with the existing home in style, structure and color, including the commission's final recommendations. Mr. Butman seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous. (6-0)

Adjourn

Approved: _____, Chairman
Date: _____