
LANDMARKS COMMISSION

May 26, 2009

Minutes

Members Present: Rick Weatherl
Robert Calk
Steve Butman
Peebles Lee
Bill Minter
Dr. Michael E. McClellan
Phil Miller
Tina Cargile - Alternate

Members Absent:
Laura Wardroup

Staff Present: Ben Bryner, Planning Services Manager
Molinda Parker, Senior Planner, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelley Messer, Assistant City Attorney

Guests: Jere Welch, Applicant
Robert Hoemke, Owner - Airtite Products
Bob Kirby, Sales Associate - Airtite Products

Mr. Weatherl called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM, declared a quorum present, and read the opening statement.

Minutes of the April 28, 2009 meeting were submitted for approval. Mr. Butman made the first motion to approve the minutes and Mr. Miller seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous (7-0).

Agenda Item 3: CA-2009-03, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Jere Welch to replace 50 windows in the Bacon House located at 1545 N. 5th Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report and presented photos of the property showing the existing windows in the house, a photo taken prior to the removal of the original windows and both wood and vinyl window sash options.

Mr. Weatherl opened the discussion to the public and asked the applicant, Ms. Welch, to address the commission. Ms. Welch introduced herself as owner of the property at 1545 N. 5th Street and explained that the lack of ventilation and energy efficiency were major reasons why she proposes to replace the fixed panes of glass with single-hung windows. Ms. Welch is licensed by the state for foster care and the lack of windows for emergency access almost kept her from obtaining a license. However, for safety reasons alone, windows that open are a necessity. Mr. Weatherl concurred that emergency exits are clearly a safety concern. Ms. Welch mentioned that the home she owns at 417 Mulberry, behind her house, had all the windows replaced by Airtite Windows. She also submitted a photo of the house with the original windows showing only one cross-piece or muntin.

She explained that her purpose is to restore the home to its original look and the vinyl windows that Airtite has proposed will accomplish that goal. She added that since the original windows are non-existent, this project will actually be restorative.

Dr. McClellan asked if she intends to install single or double hung windows. Ms. Welch said she prefers single-hung, so that she can open the bottom half for ventilation. Ms. Lee asked about the proposed color and Ms. Welch replied that the window sashes will be white like the original.

Mr. Weatherl asked Mr. Hoemke to address the commission. Mr. Hoemke confirmed his address as 4008 S. Treadaway. He explained that the vinyl windows will vary in width only 1/8" from the original wood and will provide much needed ventilation and energy efficiency. The one-by-four's (1"x 4"), window sills and interior trim will remain, only the sash is replaced. Window screens will actually diminish the width of the sash even more when they are installed, which will also enhance the historic appearance. Mr. Kirby concurred that the window sills are in good shape, as he examined them when he measured the windows. Mr. Hoemke commented that water damage to some of the window sills may have occurred and those would have to be replaced. Mr. Miller asked if the windows will fit exactly and Mr. Hoemke responded that they would be downsized overall by 1/4". Mr. Butman asked if the rooms would be brighter with the half-screens on the windows. Mr. Hoemke responded that it is up to Ms. Welch to make that decision. Ms. Lee commented that it is easier to clean the windows with the half-screen as they are designed for that purpose. Mr. Hoemke, using a sample window sash, demonstrated the process of opening the lower window section to clean both the top and bottom panes.

Mr. Weatherl closed the public hearing and opened the discussion among the commissioners. Dr. McClellan asked if there is a problem, among the commissioners, with the vinyl as opposed to wood windows. Mr. Miller explained that the vinyl is acceptable but adding the full screens would enhance the historic appearance. Mr. Minter pointed out that Ms. Welch has worked to improve the property and preserve the historic integrity of the home. Mr. Weatherl closed the discussion.

Mr. Minter made a motion to approve Ms. Welch's request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of 52 vinyl windows with the condition that full screens be installed. Mr. Butman seconded the motion. The vote for approval was (6-1) with Ms. Lee the dissenting vote.

Adjourn

Approved: _____, Chairman
Date: _____