LANDMARKS COMMISSION December 6, 2011 Minutes

Members Present:	Bill Minter Robert Calk Rick Weatherl Dr. Michael E. McClellan Phil Miller Steve Butman Pebbles Lee
Members Absent:	All present
Staff Present:	Ben Bryner, Planning Services Manager Molinda Parker, Historic Preservation Officer
Guests:	Mikel Rowe, Director of Special Projects -TSTC – Applicant Mattia Bray - Applicant Kurt Virdine- Applicant Isabel Lee – Student observer Lucy Danley – Student Observer

Mr. Weatherl called the meeting to order at 4:03 PM, declared a quorum present and read the opening statement. Minutes of the November 8, 2011 meeting were submitted for approval. Mr. Minter made a motion to accept the minutes as written and Mr. Calk seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous (7-0).

<u>Agenda Item 3</u>: CA-2011-14, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof replacement and repairs to the exterior on the residential property located at 3435 S. 9th Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report through a Power Point presentation describing the project.

Mr. Weatherl opened the public hearing and asked for comments. Ms. Bass, the property owner, was not in attendance and no one else came forward to speak. Mr. Weatherl closed the public hearing. He asked if there were any questions or comments from the commissioners. After hearing none he asked for a motion to approve the case. Mr. McClellan made a motion to approve CA-2011-14.

Mr. Minter seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (7-0).

<u>Agenda Item 4</u>: CA-2011-15, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for sign installation on the T&P Freight Warehouse located at 901 N 1st Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report through a Power Point presentation describing the project. Mr. Weatherl opened the public hearing and asked for comments. Mr. Rowe introduced himself as an educational director at the Texas State Technical College and is responsible for obtaining a grant for the digital sign that is proposed for installation on the T&P Warehouse building. The sign will be used to advertise events at the Culinary Institute. Ms. Lee voiced concern regarding the stability of the installation and protection from theft or vandalism. Mr. Minter commented on the success of the Culinary Institute's program as evidenced by wonderful lunches and dinners frequently offered to the public. Mr. Calk inquired if the proposed signs are compatible with the current sign ordinance. Mr. Bryner stated that the signs are acceptable and would be "grandfathered" in the event that the revised standards of the new sign ordinance were more restrictive.

Mr. Weatherl thanked Mr. Rowe for his input and asked if anyone else would like to speak. After hearing no comments, he closed the public hearing. He asked if there were any questions or comments from the commissioners. After hearing none he asked for a motion to approve the case. Mr. Calk made a motion to approve CA-2011-15. Mr. Butman seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (7-0).

<u>Agenda Item 5</u>: CA-2011-16, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement on the Young/Martin House located at 902 Sayles Blvd.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report through a Power Point presentation describing the project. Several options were shown as possible solutions to the historic window replacement conundrum. The applicant was not present. The discussion continued among the commissioners as the slides were reviewed and questions were answered. At 4:45 pm, as the last slide was under final scrutiny the, applicant arrived.

Mr. Weatherl opened the public hearing and asked for comments. Mr. Virdine introduced himself as a resident of Abilene and the contractor overseeing the renovation of the home at 902 Sayles Blvd. Mr. Virdine stated his case for the replacement of the original windows. His reasons were the following: the high cost and impracticality of repairing the existing windows; the fact that six windows are missing; the original windows, even with storm windows installed are not as energy efficient as the double-pane vinyl windows; and the single-hung Airtite windows with external muntins are twice as expensive as the proposed Wind Core double-hung vinyl windows.

Discussion ensued among the commissioners and with the applicant concerning the pros and cons of original vs. new windows. Hindrances include lead paint abatement, overall costs, energy efficiency, maintenance and aesthetics.

Mr. Weatherl stated that, in his view, the vinyl windows with internal muntins were not acceptable. Mr. Virdine responded that the Screen It Again Company, shown in the presentation, offers a viable alternative. He proposed to purchase the Wind Core double-hung, insulated, vinyl windows without muntins. Custom grills, ordered from the Screen It Again Company, measured and cut precisely for each window would then be installed directly on the glass of the vinyl window thus fulfilling the requirement of external muntins.

Mr. McClellan left the Council Chamber at 5:05 pm.

Mr. Weatherl thanked Mr. Virdine for his input and asked if anyone else would like to speak. After hearing no comments, he closed the public hearing. He commented that the final proposal of vinyl windows with the external grid would solve both issues of visual appearance and energy efficiency. Mr. Calk responded that he would personally prefer to keep and maintain the original windows as he has done in his own historic home, but understood the advantage of this proposed alternative. Mr. Weatherl asked if there were any further questions or comments from the commissioners. After hearing none he asked for a motion to approve the case. Mr. Calk made a motion to approve CA-2011-16 with the external grid alternative. Mr. Minter seconded the motion. Mr. Butman voted to disapprove. The vote was (5-1).

<u>Agenda Item 6</u>: HPT-0411, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Historic Project Tax credit for roof replacement at 742 Amarillo Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report through a Power Point presentation describing the project.

Mr. Weatherl opened the public hearing and asked for comments. Ms. Bray introduced herself as the owner of the property located at742 Amarillo. She explained that the new roof color, Rustic Hickory, highlights the red front door and creates a warm contrast with the deep green exterior. She and her husband receive many positive compliments, from their neighbors.

Mr. Weathrl closed the public hearing. He asked if there were any questions or comments from the commissioners. After hearing none he asked for a motion to approve the case. Mr. Miller made a motion to approve HPT-0411. Ms. Lee seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (6-0).

Commissioner Miller stepped down from the dais to represent his case.

<u>Agenda Item 7</u>: HPT-0511, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Historic Project Tax credit for roof replacement at 2241 College Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report through a Power Point presentation describing the project.

Mr. Weatherl opened the public hearing and asked for comments. Mr. Miller introduced himself as the owner of the property located at 2241 College Street. He explained that the new roof shingles are they same brand and color as the original, but have more relief to the pattern. The metal flashing on the edge of the roof was replaced with paint drip flashing making it less shiny.

Mr. Weathrl closed the public hearing. He asked if there were any questions or comments from the commissioners. After hearing none he asked for a motion to approve the case. Mr. Butman made a motion to approve HPT-0511. Mr. Calk seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (5-0).

Commissioner Miller returned to the dais to participate in the remaining cases.

<u>Agenda Item 8</u>: HPT-0611, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Historic Project Tax credit for exterior painting at 2041 S.8th Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report through a Power Point presentation describing the project. Mr. Weatherl opened the public hearing and asked for comments. Ms. Comer, the property owner, was not in attendance and no one else came forward to speak. Mr. Weatherl closed the public hearing. He asked if there were any questions or comments from the commissioners. After hearing none he asked for a motion to approve the case. Ms. Lee made a motion to approve HPT-0611. Mr. Butman seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (6-0).

<u>Agenda Item 9</u>: HPT-0711, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for a Historic Project Tax credit for roof replacement at 704 Beech Street.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report through a Power Point presentation describing the project.

Mr. Weatherl opened the public hearing and asked for comments. Mr. Logan, the property owner, was not in attendance and no one else came forward to speak. Mr. Weatherl closed the public hearing. He asked if there were any questions or comments from the commissioners. After hearing none he asked for a motion to approve the case. Mr.. Minter made a motion to approve HPT-0711. Ms. Lee seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (6-0).

Commissioner Lee stepped down from the dais to represent her case.

Agenda Item 10: HOZ-2011-17, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of Historic Overlay Zoning to be designated to the residential property located at 873 River Crest Drive.

Mr. Weatherl read the above case description and asked Ms. Parker to give the staff report. Ms. Parker reviewed the staff report through a Power Point presentation describing the project.

Mr. Weatherl opened the public hearing and asked for comments. Ms. Lee introduced herself as the owner of the property located at 873 River Crest Drive. She further described the history of her home including the original owners, the Grishams, who built the house in 1928 and resided there for over forty years. Most of the additions were built by the Grishams. The details that were shown in the presentation included the wrought iron gates and screens, which Ms. Lee confirmed were produced by a skilled artisan from Mexico. She added that future plans include installing a new roof.

Mr. Weatherl closed the public hearing. He asked if there were any questions or comments from the commissioners. Mr. Minter commented that this is one of the great houses of Abilene. After hearing no further comments he asked for a motion to approve the case. Mr. Minter made a motion to approve HOZ-201-17. Mr. Calk seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous (5-0).

Mr. Weatherl asked for a motion to adjourn at 5:41 P.M. Mr. Calk made a motion to adjourn. Mr. Butman seconded the motion. The vote to adjourn was unanimous (5-0).

Approved:	 	_,
Chairman		