
LANDMARKS COMMISSION

June 28th, 2016

Minutes

Members Present: Steve Butman
 Pebbles Lee
 Dr. Michael McClellan
 Bill Minter
 Rick Weatherl

Members Absent: Phil Miller

Staff Present: Ben Bryner, Planning Services Manager
 Emily Bronaugh, Planner, Historic Preservation Officer
 Dana Schoening, Director of Planning & Zoning
 Kelley Messer, Assistant City Attorney
 Melissa Farr, Administrative Secretary (Recording)

Guests Present: Larry Sullivan
 Greg Shaheen
 Amanda Merkel

Mr. Steve Butman called the meeting to order at 4:01 P.M., declared a quorum present, and read the opening statement.

Minutes of the March 29th, 2016 meeting were submitted for approval.

Mrs. Lee made a motion to approve the minutes, Chairman Butman seconded the motion. The minutes were approved unanimously.

CA-2016-02, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Frances Burditt, agent Robert Calk, for roof replacement of the homelocated at 2145 Idlewild St.

Mr. Bryner presented the staff report for this case. The Burditt House, 1928, is a tudor style home located in the Sayles Blvd neighborhood. It is a contributing property to this historic neighborhood. It was granted Historic Overlay Zoning in 1996.

The request is to replace the roof, which was damaged in a recent hail storm. The existing roof material is asbestos shingles which are no longer available for replacement. The proposed new roof will be a laminate shingle in an onyx black color. The laminate shingle has been use recently on other homes. The agent, Mr. Calk, will bring samples of the proposed roofing material to the meeting and will discuss color options if needed.

SPECIAL CONSIDERATIONS: Proper maintenance is integral to the upkeep of a historic property. The selected of color will be compatible with the style of architecture of the house and the surrounding neighborhood.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: A committee met regarding the replacement of the roof prior to the Landmarks Commission meeting. The committee determined that the need to replace the roof early was warranted. Thus, the work has commenced.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval.

Chairman Butman opened the public hearing at 4:05 PM. No one came forward and the public hearing was closed.

Dr. McClellan made a motion to approve CA-2016-02. Mr. Minter seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous (5-0).

HPT-2016-01, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval of an application for Historic Project Tax Reduction submitted by Greg Shaheen for fence repair expenses on the residential property located at 1120 Elmwood Dr.

Mr. Bryner presented the staff report for this case. The Moreland/Shahen House (also referred to as the “Sugar” House,) was built in 1946 in the Art Moderne Style of the Modernistic Architectural movement. It was granted Historic Overlay Zoning by the Landmarks Commission in October, 2007. It remains Abilene’s least altered example of this style that was made popular in the 1920’s and 30’s after being showcased in the 1933 World’s Fair in Chicago. It remained a popular building style until the 1950’s.

Work performed was restoration of the existing iron fencing. The fencing was cut, rust removed, reinstalled with new supports, treated for oxidation, and painted with 2 coats.

The total cost of the project is \$10,550. The receipt for the work has been provided.

SPECIAL CONSIDERATIONS: The work performed did not require a Certificate of Appropriateness since it was maintenance and upkeep. All work performed complies with the *Secretary of the Interiors Guidelines* for Treatment (Preservation) of a Historic Property.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval.

Chairman Butman opened the public hearing at 4:10 PM.

Greg Shaheen spoke to powder coated fencing question posed by Chairman Butman. Mr. Shaheen stated that the fence was not powder coated.

Discussion was held on the fencing mounts, the gate, and the fence itself on the property.

Chairman Butman closed the public hearing at 4:12 PM.

Mr. Weatherl made a motion to approve HPT-2016-01. Mrs. Lee seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous (5-0).

CA-2016-03, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Greg Shaheen for replacement of rain gutters and the roof, painting of the entire house, and filling in of mortar along the white Austin stone at the home located at 1120 Elmwood Dr.

Mr. Bryner presented the staff report for this case. The Moreland/Shahen House (also referred to as the “Sugar” House,) was built in 1946 in the Art Moderne Style of the Modernistic Architectural movement. It was granted Historic Overlay Zoning by the Landmarks Commission in October, 2007. It remains Abilene’s least altered example of this style that was made popular in the 1920’s and 30’s after being showcased in the 1933 World’s Fair in Chicago. It remained a popular building style until the 1950’s.

The request is to replace the gutters and the roof. Additionally, the entire house will be repainted utilizing the same paint color. Finally, mortar will be filled in where needed along the white Austin stone of the home. The roof is a flat roof and will be replaced with a new roof to match the existing. The other exterior repairs (gutters, paint, & mortar) will match the existing material and colors.

SPECIAL CONSIDERATIONS: Proper maintenance is integral to the upkeep of a historic property. The proposed improvements will maintain the style of architecture of the house and the surrounding neighborhood.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval.

Discussion was held with Mrs. Lee and the staff about what elements of the home would be painted.

Chairman Butman opened the public hearing at 4:15 PM.

The Commission asked what type of roof the home had. Mr. Shaheen stated that it was a tar, gravel, and roll type. Further discussion was held on roof options.

Mrs. Lee asked if this work had been proposed before. Mr. Shaheen stated that it was discussed in 2011, but that no work was done. He stated that in the future he may replace the entire stone façade.

Mr. Weatherl asked if Mr. Shaheen had considered repairing the gutters rather than replacing them. Mr. Shaheen responded that they were too damaged, and that he would prefer wider gutters.

Chairman Butman closed the public hearing at 4:23 PM.

Mr. Weatherl made a motion to approve CA-2016-03. Mrs. Lee seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous (5-0) with the condition that the gutter downspout profile matches the existing.

HOZ-2016-01, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval for a Historic Overlay Zoning application submitted by Taylor County Disabled American Vets, Chapter 36 for the building located at 2555 Grape St.

Mr. Bryner presented the staff report for this case. The Taylor County Disabled American Veterans, Chapter 36 Chapter House was a building that was brought from Camp Barkeley after it closed down. It is a single-story structure with a porch overhang in the front. It was brought to this site in September of 1948 where it was repaired to serve as the house for the local chapter.

SPECIAL CONSIDERATIONS: The structure has had external alterations since original construction. Building records do show that there was a 30' x 40' addition to the building in 1972. The roof was also replaced in 1997.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval. The planning staff recognizes the historic significance of the structure under the criteria that it has historical, archeological or cultural significance or value to the development, heritage or cultural, characteristics of the city.

Chairman Butman opened the public hearing at 4:30 PM. No one came forward and the public meeting was closed.

Discussion was held on the merits of the overlay.

Ms. Lee inquired to whether the overlay has ever been approved for a building that has been moved. The commission concluded that it has.

Mr. Weatherl made a motion to approve HOZ-2016-01. Mr. Minter seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous (5-0).

CA-2016-04, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Austin D. Merkel for an addition of a cedar pergola, removal of a backyard cellar, and replacement & expansion of a chain-link fence with a wooden decorative fence at the home located at 1002 Grand Ave.

Mr. Bryner presented the staff report for this case. The Reed/Fulwiler/Bussey House was built in 1921 in the Tudor style. It was granted Historic Overlay Zoning by the Landmarks Commission in December, 1996.

The request is to add a new 12' x 15' cedar pergola over the rear patio of the home. Additionally, the existing chain-link fence is proposed to be removed and replaced with a new wooden decorative fence. The area to be enclosed will be expanded toward the exterior side property line and remain 16 feet from the curb on S. 10th St. Finally, there is an existing backyard cellar that is proposed to be filled in and sod over with grass.

SPECIAL CONSIDERATIONS: Proper maintenance is integral to the upkeep of a historic property. The proposed improvements will maintain the style of architecture of the house and the surrounding neighborhood.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval.

Chairman Butman opened the public hearing at 4:41 PM.

Amanda Merkel spoke to the fencing and the proposed pergola. She stated that the fence would be natural/stained rather than painted, and that she was fine with not attaching the pergola to the home. Further discussion was held about reasons for not attaching the pergola.

Chairman Butman closed the public hearing at 4:49 PM.

Mrs. Lee made a motion to approve CA-2016-04. Mr. Weatherl seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous (5-0) with the condition that the pergola be completely detached from the home.

CA-2016-05, Public hearing, discussion and possible approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness submitted by Larry Sullivan for replacement of the south windows in the rear addition, addition of a window on the south façade, closure of an existing door and replacement with a window, demolition of a detached garage, an addition to the house on the northwest side, and addition of columns & roof treatment on the front of the home located at 1242 Highland Ave.

Mr. Bryner presented the staff report for this case. The Oates/Green House was built in 1925 in the Craftsman style. It was granted Historic Overlay Zoning by the Landmarks Commission in December, 1996.

The request is to do the following:

1. Replace the south windows in the rear bedroom addition. New vinyl windows are requested that will match the look of the existing windows.
2. Add a window on the south façade next to the existing door for a room that does not have a window. A vinyl window is again requested that will match the other windows.
3. Close the door on the south façade and replace with a new window to match the other windows.
4. Demolish and remove the detached garage behind the house.
5. Construct an addition in the northwest portion of the house. The proposed walls will align with the existing adjacent perimeter walls. The walls are proposed to have siding instead of brick.
6. The addition of columns and a roof treatment on the front of the house.

The applicant will be present to discuss each proposed improvement to the site and home.

SPECIAL CONSIDERATIONS: Proper maintenance is integral to the upkeep of a historic property. The proposed improvements will maintain the style of architecture of the house and the surrounding neighborhood.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval.

Chairman Butman opened the public hearing at 5:01 PM.

Mr. Sullivan spoke to changes being proposed on his property. He assured the commissioners that the addition would tie in to the roof and would have a low pitch. Discussion was then held about his other requests.

Mr. Weatherl asked if Mr. Sullivan planned to remove steps leading to the exterior door. Mr. Sullivan stated that he planned to. Discussion was then held on the new windows that Mr. Sullivan planned to install.

Discussion was held on the front façade treatment. Mr. Weatherl stated that the proposed plan was not appropriate, and Mrs. Lee agreed. Mr. Weatherl suggested a temporary covering, such as canvas, might be more appropriate. Mr. Sullivan stated that he intended to match some elements of the craftsman style with the pergola. Discussion was held on the removal of the front façade treatment from the request and be brought back at a later date with more specific details. Mr. Sullivan agreed to the request.

Chairman Butman closed the public hearing at 5:27 PM.

Mr. Weatherl made a motion to approve CA-2016-05 noting the removal of the front façade treatment from the request. Mrs. Lee seconded the motion. The vote for approval was unanimous (5-0).

Chairman Butman made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 5:30 PM. The vote to adjourn was unanimous (5-0).

Approved: _____,

Chairman: _____